



Mayor

Dee Margo

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Alexandra Annello

District 3

Cassandra H. Brown

District 4

Sam Morgan

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz
Perez

District 7

Henry Rivera

District 8

Cissy Lizarraga

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET
JANUARY 22, 2018, 4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, January 22, 2018, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman D.J. Sevigny
Commissioner Vicki Hamilton
Commissioner Sherry Knapp Mowles
Commissioner Charles Stapler
Commissioner Kelly Blough
Commissioner Don Luciano
Commissioner Geoffrey Wright
Commissioner Sergio Ramos

The following commissioner was not present:

Vice-Chairman Samuel Trimble

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development
Mr. Omar DeLaRosa, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Sevigny called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Chairman Sevigny asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *There was no response.*



1. PHAP18-00002	6 Mills W. 120 Ft. of Blk. (120 Ft. on San Antonio X 167.67 Ft. on El Paso) (20120.40 Sq. Ft.) and 14 Mills 80 Ft. on San Antonio 65.333 Ft. on El Paso NWC, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	Corner of San Antonio and Mills Streets
Historic District:	Downtown
Property Owner:	Mills Plaza Parking II, LP
Representative:	Richard Bransford
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	C-5/H (Commercial/Historic)
Year Built:	N/A
Historic Status:	N/A
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a multi-story garage on two empty lots
Application Filed:	01/08/18
45 Day Expiration:	02/22/18

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a multi-story garage on two empty lots in the Downtown historic district. The proposed parking garage construction will span two lots; both lots are located on the corners of San Antonio and Mills Streets. One lot has been a parking lot for some time; however, the lot across the street is vacant due to a building fire in April, 2012.

The property owner is proposing to construct a parking garage on both lots with connecting bridges, for each floor of the parking garage, spanning across San Antonio Street. Total number of parking spaces is 540 ±. The proposed structures will have a total of five floors and the first floor will serve as commercial/retail spaces.

Parking garages are notoriously difficult to construct in an aesthetically pleasing, historically compatible manner. The challenges are many and this is not the first time a parking garage will be constructed in the Downtown district; furthermore, there is a basis for this.



HLC Presentation
01.22.18.pptx



There is an existing parking garage that doesn't resemble a parking garage, located at the site of the former St. Regis hotel adjacent to the Mills building. The former St. Regis hotel was demolished to accommodate the remodeling/renovating of the Mills Building.

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- *Any new construction must be compatible in size, texture, color, design, proportion and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and must follow the specific architecture styles designated appropriate for that particular zone (Pioneer Plaza Zone and San Antonio Street Zone). Keep in mind, however, that incorporating existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.*
- *New structures should respect the integrity of existing buildings. Existing historic structures and streetscape need to be taken into consideration before designing new infill construction. Setbacks, proportion, rhythm and building elements should all be addressed.*
- *New construction should duplicate some of the masonry detailing found on historic landmarks.*
- *Appropriate materials for the Pioneer Plaza, San Jacinto Plaza, San Antonio and South El Paso Zones are brick, stone, terra-cotta, glazed tile, and concrete.*
- *Solids and voids (walls to windows and doors) create a pattern in the façade of a building. The pattern of solids and voids then establishes rhythm.*
- *Windows should be similar in size and spacing to those of the historic landmarks within each zone.*
- *Pioneer Plaza Zone: New infill construction and additions to existing structures should maintain and reinforce the existing pattern of either the Mill's Building, The Centre or the Plaza.*
- *San Antonio Zone: New infill construction and additions to existing structures should maintain and reinforce the existing pattern of the Popular.*



- *The relationship between the height and width of a building establishes proportion. The proportions of new buildings should be consistent with the dominant proportions of existing buildings (vertically and horizontally).*
- *Pioneer Plaza Zone: Proportion and spacing of new construction should be similar to that of the Mill's Building or the Plaza Hotel.*
- *San Antonio Zone: Proportion and spacing of new construction should be similar to that of the one or two-part commercial type. The one-part commercial block is essentially a single story structure with a recessed entry and a decorated façade. Two-part commercial differs from one-part in height only. The two-part commercial block is simply a structure of two to three stories and is characterized by a horizontal division into two distinct zones. Although the overall building was constructed in a particular architectural style, zones may or may not be similar. For example, lower zones (street level) have been altered to the extent that it is no longer in character with the upper zones.*
- *Lighting should be provided in alleys and parking areas/lots.*
- *Landscaping within the historic district should be consistent: Tree spacing should coordinate with existing and proposed lighting installation.*
- *Historically, awnings were covered with canvas. Canvas and other synthetics (woven acrylics) should be used on awnings. Shiny fabrics, however, may distract from a building's appearance and should therefore be avoided.*
- *Prefabricated metal awnings designed for residential use should be avoided.*
- *Awnings and canopies should be of an appropriate size and scale in relation to the building's façade.*
- *Fixtures should not extend across the façades of several buildings. Instead, fixtures should fit within vertical elements such as columns.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*



THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:

- 1. THAT THE BUILDING FAÇADES BE A COMBINATION OF CONCRETE AND BRICK VENEER;*
- 2. THAT THE LIGHTING BE RECESSED OR SMALL ENOUGH TO NOT DRAW ATTENTION TO ITSELF;*
- 3. THAT THE LIGHTING PLAN BE SUBMITTED PRIOR TO THE SUBMISSION OF DRAWINGS FOR A PERMIT;*
- 4. THAT THE OVERPASS ON SAN ANTONIO STREET BE EMBELLISHED WITH SOME DETAILING;*
- 5. THAT LANDSCAPING IN THE FORM OF POTTED PLANTS AND/OR TREES BE PROVIDED AROUND THE PERIMETER OF THE BUILDING; AND*
- 6. THAT THE AWNINGS BE MADE OF CANVAS.*

Following the presentation, Ms. Velázquez responded to comments and questions from commissioners.

The following representatives of the property owner made remarks and responded to comments and questions from commissioners:

1. William Kell, Vice-President, Franklin Mountain Management, a Paul Foster company, would like commissioners to approve this request, as submitted, without modifications.
2. John Purinton, SE, Principal, Watry Design, Inc.
3. Mike Nielson, AIA, LEED-AP, Architect, Watry Design, Inc., thought there could be some ornamentation added to the bridge spans across San Antonio and Mills Streets.
4. Bill Helm, In*Situ Architecture, consultants on the project, explained the rendering colors were not, by any means, the final color selection. He reiterated the representatives are asking commissioners to approve this request as submitted with the consideration that representatives would come before commissioners with a couple of color schemes to choose from.



During the discussion between commissioners and the representatives, Commissioner Hamilton assumed Ms. Velázquez's modification regarding the brick veneer was not for the whole building but rather, per the rendering, in the areas that appear to show where brick would be located.

Diana Ramos, member of the public, El Paso resident, really liked the design and suggested having a green wall through the bridge portion of the parking garage. The green wall might be a way to modernize what was going on downtown but also add a cool aspect of the design that might lessen the impact of having a parking garage downtown and also beautify and modernize what the structure could be.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Luciano, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND CARRIED TO APPROVE AS SUBMITTED AND THAT THEY COME BACK REGARDING THE FINAL ON THE COLORING***

***ABSTAIN: Commissioner Hamilton
Commissioner Sevigny***

2. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. January 22, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled at the February 5, 2018 meeting. February 5, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 19, 2018 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners.



HLC Staff Report

3. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Blough **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THESE REVIEWS AS SUBMITTED.**

Other Business – Discussion and Action

4. Discussion and action on Regular meeting minutes for January 8, 2018.

Chairman Sevigny asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections and/or revisions for the January 8, 2018 meeting minutes.

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Stapler, seconded by Chairman Sevigny **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED THAT THE MINUTES BE ACCEPTED AS READ.**

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Wright

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Wright **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 5:02 P.M.**